Mentor Selection Scorecard

This scorecard is designed to help automotive dealerships objectively evaluate and select service technician mentors for an apprenticeship program. It intentionally prioritizes teaching ability, professionalism, and cultural impact over raw production because mentors shape skills, habits, and standards that persist long after the apprenticeship ends. A mentor is not chosen   
for what they know, but for what they will pass on.

## How to use this scorecard

* Score each category based on **observed behavior**, not reputation.
* Use a 1–5 scale for each criterion.
* Any ratings of 1 or 2 may signal a high-risk candidate regardless of total score.

## Section 1: Technical Competence & Work Quality

*A mentor must be technically sound, but perfection is not required.*

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Criterion** | **1** | **3** | **5** | **Score** |
| Diagnostic accuracy | Frequent guesswork, misdiagnosis | Generally  accurate | Consistently accurate, methodical |  |
| Comeback  history | High or recurring comebacks | Acceptable, within show norms | Very low  comeback rate |  |
| OEM procedure compliance | Regular shortcuts | Usually follows procedures | Models OEM standards consistently |  |
| Tool and equipment discipline | Unsafe or careless | Generally appropriate | Exemplary safety and care |  |
| Documentation quality | Incomplete or inconsistent | Adequate | Clear, thorough, audit-ready |  |

**Section 1 Subtotal (max 25):** \_\_\_ / 25

## Section 2: Teaching & Communication Ability

*This is the most predictive category of mentor success.*

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Criterion** | **1** | **3** | **5** | **Score** |
| Explains "why" behind tasks | Rarely explains | Explains when asked | Proactively explains concepts |  |
| Breaks work  into steps | Overwhelming  or vague | Sometimes structured | Consistently clear and logical |  |
| Patience during learning | Easily frustrated | Tolerates  learning curve | Calm and encouraging |  |
| Feedback delivery | Harsh or unclear | Neutral, limited coaching | Constructive  and specific |  |
| Allows safe struggle | Takes over  too early | Inconsistent balance | Coaches without rescuing |  |

**Section 2 Subtotal (max 25):** \_\_\_ / 25

## Section 3: Professionalism & Cultural Influence

*Apprentices will copy these behaviors exactly.*

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Criterion** | **1** | **3** | **5** | **Score** |
| Respect toward others | Dismissive or demeaning | Generally respectful | Consistently respectful |  |
| Reaction to mistakes | Blame or ridicule | Corrects errors neutrally | Uses mistakes to promote learning |  |
| Standards under pressure | Cuts corners | Mixed consistency | Maintains standards always |  |
| Attitude toward training | Resentful or cynical | Neutral | Actively supportive |  |
| Role-model behavior | Poor example | Acceptable | Sets the standard |  |

**Section 3 Subtotal (max 25):** \_\_\_ / 25

## Section 4: Willingness & Commitment to Mentor Role

*Apprentices will copy these behaviors exactly.*

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Criterion** | **1** | **3** | **5** | **Score** |
| Voluntary participation | Assigned or reluctant | Mild interest | Actively wants role |  |
| Motivation for mentoring | Personal gain only | Mixed reasons | Long-term  shop success |  |
| Acceptance of accountability | Avoids responsibility | Accepts with limits | Fully accepts responsibility |  |
| Openness to evaluation | Defensive | Accepts feedback | Seeks improvement |  |
| Reliability and follow-through | Inconsistent | Generally reliable | Highly  dependable |  |

**Section 4 Subtotal (max 25):** \_\_\_ / 25

## Section 5: Willingness & Commitment to Mentor Role

*Mentors must each while production pressure exists.*

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Criterion** | **1** | **3** | **5** | **Score** |
| Communication under stress | Abrupt or  impatient | Variable | Clear and calm |  |
| Balancing speed and learning | Rushes or  stalls work | Inconsistent | Manages both effectively |  |
| Escalation judgment | Ignores issues | Escalates late | Escalates early and appropriately |  |
| Adaptability | Rigid | Some flexibility | Adjusts approach per learner |  |
| Consistency  across days | Mood-dependent | Mostly consistent | Consistently  steady |  |

**Section 5 Subtotal (max 25):** \_\_\_ / 25

## Section 6: Leadership & Long-Term Potential

*Strong mentors often become future leaders.*

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Criterion** | **1** | **3** | **5** | **Score** |
| Informal leadership | Negative influence | Neutral | Positive influence |  |
| Problem-solving approach | Reactive | Adequate | Proactive and structured |  |
| Accountability mindset | Deflects blame | Sometimes accepts responsibility | Owns outcomes fully |  |
| Development orientation | Self-focused | Mixed | Invested in others |  |
| Alignment with management | Resistant | Generally aligned | Strong alignment |  |

**Section 6 Subtotal (max 25):** \_\_\_ / 25

## Total Score Summary

* **Maximum Score**: 150
* **Candidate Total Score**: \_\_\_ / 150

## Interpretation Guide

* **130–150 (Strong Mentor Candidate)**: Highly recommended. Low risk, high impact.
* **110–129 (Conditional Mentor)**: Proceed with support and monitoring.
* **90–109 (High Risk)**: Mentor only with significant structure and protection.
* **Below 90 (Do Not Select)**: Likely to harm apprentice and program.

## Automatic Disqualifiers (Regardless of Score)

* Pattern of cutting corners or unsafe practices
* Disrespectful behavior toward less-experienced staff
* Reluctance or resentment toward mentoring role
* History of toxic or undermining behavior

## Final Decision Record

* Mentor Candidate Name: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
* Evaluators (Service Manager/Foreman/HR): \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_
* Decision: ☐ Select   
   ☐ Conditional   
   ☐ Do Not Select
* Conditions or Support Required: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

**Disclaimer:** *These materials have been prepared for informational purposes only. Nothing in the materials is intended to constitute legal advice. Consumers should contact their attorney to obtain advice with respect to any particular legal matter. The presentation of this information is not intended to encourage concerted action among competitors or any other action on the part of dealers that would in any manner fix or stabilize the price or any element of the price of any good or service.*